

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

STATE OF NEW YORK, *et al.*,

Plaintiffs,

v.

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF  
COMMERCE, *et al.*,

Defendants.

No. 1:18-cv-2921 (JMF)

**NOTICE OF FILING OF DEFENDANTS' OBJECTIONS TO PLAINTIFFS'  
SUPPLEMENTAL EXHIBITS**

Attached please find Defendants' Objections to Plaintiffs' Supplemental Exhibits.

Dated: November 4, 2018

Respectfully submitted,

JOSEPH H. HUNT  
Assistant Attorney General

BRETT A. SHUMATE  
Deputy Assistant Attorney General

JOHN R. GRIFFITHS  
Director, Federal Programs Branch

CARLOTTA P. WELLS  
Assistant Director, Federal Programs Branch

/s/ Carol Federighi  
KATE BAILEY  
GARRETT COYLE  
STEPHEN EHRLICH  
CAROL FEDERIGHI  
Trial Attorneys  
United States Department of Justice  
Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch  
P.O. Box 883  
Washington, DC 20044  
Tel.: (202) 514-1903  
Email: [carol.federighi@usdoj.gov](mailto:carol.federighi@usdoj.gov)

*Counsel for Defendants*

**DEFENDANTS' OBJECTIONS TO PLAINTIFFS' SUPPLEMENTAL EXHIBIT LIST**

Exhibit #	Description	Objections	Date Identified (Leave Blank)	Date Entered (Leave Blank)
PX-542	Email between David Langdon, Earl Comstock, Ellen Herbst, subject: Counting of Illegal Immigrants (5/24/17) [AR 0012465]	403 <sup>1</sup>		
PX-543	Email between David Langdon, Earl Comstock, Ellen Herbst, subject: RE Counting of Illegal Immigrants (5/24/17) [COM_DIS00020862]	*		
PX-544	Email between David Langdon and Sahra Park-Su; subject: FWD: Alert: Commerce Secretary Suggested Citizenship Question to Justice Dept., According to Memo, Contradicting His Congressional (6/22/18) [COM_DIS00015108]	401, 403, 602		
PX-545	Email between David Langdon, Peter Davidson, James Uthmeier, Aaron Willard, Sahra Park-Su, subject: Re: Questions Re: draft census memo (1/30/18) [AR 0001976]	403		
PX-546	Email between John Abowd, Burton Reist, Enrique Lamas, copying Victoria Velkoff, Albert Fontenot; subject: Re: I need the answers in a response to Earl before 10:30 (1/31/18) [AR 0005212]	403		
PX-547	Email between Sahra Park-Su and Jacque Mason, Mike Platt, Brian Lenihan, Israel Hernandez, copying Aaron Willard, Karen Kelley, Cameron Dorsey; subject: RE: Follow-up to today's Meeting (9/1/17) [AR 0001378]	403		
PX-548	House Oversight and Government Reform Hearing QFRs to Secretary Wilbur Ross Hearing Date October 12, 2017 [COM_DIS00014166]	*		
PX-549	Email between Earl Comstock to Wilbur Ross, Wendy Teramoto, copying Karen Kelley; subject: FW: Answers to Secretary Ross's Questions (10/29/17) [AR 0002446]	403		
PX-550	Email between Sahra Park-Su, Peter Davidson, copying Catherine Keller, James Uthmeier, Karen Kelley, Israel Hernandez, Earl Comstock, Brian Lenihan, Aaron Willard, Ron Jarmin, Enrique Lamas; subject: Re: Question from Secretary [AR 0003691]	403		
PX-551	Email between David Langdon and Sahra Park-Su; subject: FWD: Alert: Commerce Secretary Suggested Citizenship Question to Justice Dept., According to Memo, Contradicting His Congressional (6/22/18) [COM_DIS00013892]	*		

<sup>1</sup> Defendants reiterate that this challenge to a final agency action is properly reviewed, if at all, on the basis of the administrative record. In response to the Court's July 3, 2018 Order, Defendants collected and produced a broader set of materials than would normally be considered appropriate for an administrative record.

**DEFENDANTS' OBJECTIONS TO PLAINTIFFS' SUPPLEMENTAL  
EXHIBIT LIST**

Exhibit #	Description	Objections	Date Identified (Leave Blank)	Date Entered (Leave Blank)
PX-552	Questions on the Jan 19 Draft Census Memo on the DOJ Citizenship Question Reinstatement Request [AR 0001616]	403		
PX-553	Email between Jacque Mason, Alan Lang, copying Mike Platt, Brian Lenihan, Aaron Willard, Barry Robinson, James Uthmeier, Catherine Keller, Sahra Park-Su, subject: Here are the presentations from the PMR - please get ones missing and the contract one to Ellen (1/31/18) [AR 0001964]	403		
PX-554	Email between Sahra Park-Su, Christa Jones, copying Ron Jarmin, Enrique Lamas, Karen Kelley, Michael Walsh, Brian Lenihan, subject: Draft Response to Question (2/24/18) [AR 0013023]	403		
PX-555	Email between Sahra Park-Su, [redacted], coying Ron Jarmin, Enrique Lamas, Christa Jones, Michael Walsh, Brian Lenihan; subject re: Draft Response to Question (2.24.18) [AR 0003403]	403		
PX-556	Email between Ron Jarmin, Christ Jones, Enrique Lamas, Karen Kelley, Sahra Park-Su; subject: option D (2/23/18) [AR 0002935]	403		
PX-557	Calendar Invitation between Chelsey Neuhaus, Joseph Semsar, Karen Kelley, ExecSecBriefingBook, Michael Walsh, James Uthmeier, Mike Platt, Sahra Park-Su; subject: Stakeholder Calls (3/23/18) [AR 0001638]	403		
PX-558	Certification of Complete Administrative Record (6/8/18)	403		
PX-559	Email between Sahra Park-Su and Michael Walsh, subject: Narrative (5/15/18) [COM_DIS00014052]	401		
PX-560	Letter from Wilbur Ross, Sec. of Commerce, to Catherine E Lhamon, Chair, U.S. Comm'b on Civil Rights (7.5.18)	401		
PX-561	2020 Census Detailed Operational Plan for: 18. Nonresponse Followup Operation (NRFU) Issued April 16, 2018 Version: V1.0 Final	*		
PX-562	March 16, 2017 OIG Report (OIG-17-020-I)	602/802		
PX-563	December 2010 GAO Report (GAO-11-193)	602/802		
PX-564	Administrative Records Modeling Update for the Census Scientific Advisory Committee Spring 2017	602/802/901		

**DEFENDANTS' OBJECTIONS TO PLAINTIFFS' SUPPLEMENTAL  
EXHIBIT LIST**

Exhibit #	Description	Objections	Date Identified (Leave Blank)	Date Entered (Leave Blank)
PX-565	Emails between Earl Comstock, David Langdon, and Ellen Herbst Re: Counting of Illegal Immigrants [COM_DIS00016563 revised]	*		
PX-566	Short Calendar Entry for Meeting with Mark Meadows	602/802/901		
PX-567	Full Calendar Entry for Meeting with Rep. Mark Meadows [COMM-17-0501-B-001329 - 001330]	602/802/901		
PX-568	Briefing Memorandum for Secretary Ross from Mike Platt for 3.23.18 Decennial Census Stakeholder Call (3/22/18) [AR 0012466]	403		
PX-569	Email between Michael Walsh, Wendy Teramoto, James Rockas, Karen Kelley, Earl Comstock, subject Re: Updated with his further edits below - For your approval (3/16/18) [AR 0012467]	403		
PX-570	Email between Christa Jones, Earl Comstock, Karen Kelley, subject: Re: Seeking Comment - citizenship question (2/18/18) [AR 0012470]	403		
PX-571	Email between Earl Comstock, David Langdon, James Uthmeier, Aaron Willard, Sahra Park-Su, Peter Davidson, subject: Re: questions re: draft census memo (1/30/18) [AR 0012477]	403		
PX-572	Draft Memo from Abowd to Ross RE: Technical Review of the Department of Justice Request to Add Citizenship Question to the 2020 Census (1/19/18) [AR 0012480]	403		
PX-573	Email between Karen Kelle, Earl Comstock, Enrique Lamas, Ron jarmin, Aaron Willard, James Uthmeier, Peter Davidson, subject: Re: Questions on the January 19 Alternatives Memo (1/30/18) [AR 0012489]	403		
PX-574	Summary of Alternatives & Detailed Analysis of Alternatives by John Abowd [AR 0012493]	403		
PX-575	Memo from Abowd to Ross RE: Technical Review of the Department of Justice Request to Add Citizenship Question to the 2020 Census (1/19/18) [AR 0012501]	403		
PX-576	Email between Karen Kelley, Sahra Park-Su, Aaron Willard, Ron Jarmin, Enrique Lamas, Jacque Mason, Mike Platt, Burton Reist, Joanne Crane, Israel Hernandez, Earl Comstock, Wendy Teramoto, subject: SWLR Questions (10/28/17) [AR 0012506]	403		

**DEFENDANTS' OBJECTIONS TO PLAINTIFFS' SUPPLEMENTAL  
EXHIBIT LIST**

Exhibit #	Description	Objections	Date Identified (Leave Blank)	Date Entered (Leave Blank)
PX-577	Secretary HSGAC Hearing Q A (10/23/17) [AR 0012508]	403		
PX-578	Email between Earl Comstock, Wilbur Ross, Wendy Teramoto, Eric Branstad, subject: FW: Census Testimony for Wed. May 3 House CJS Hearing (5/1/17) [AR 0012526]	403		
PX-579	Prepared Statement of John H. Thompson Director U.S. Census Bureau Before the Appropriations Committee Subcommittee on Commerce, Justice, Science and Related Agencies, House (5/3/17) [AR 0012529]	403		
PX-580	Email between James Uthmeier, John Zadrozny, subject: Re: Hill/DOJ pushing for citizenship question on census forms: report (1/31/18) [COM_DIS00015678]	*		
PX-581	Email between Sahra Park-Su, Kelley Karen, Willard Aaron, Kevin Quinley, subject: Re: Short Fuse: FW: Census / immigration status story (Deadline: Today 2:45 pm) (12/29/17) [COM_DIS00015698]	*		
PX-582	Email between James Uthmeier, John Zadrozny, subject: Re: Hill/DOJ pushing for citizenship question on census forms: report (12/31/17) [COM_DIS00015704]	*		
PX-583	Email between John Zadrozny and [redacted] subject: Re: Hill/DOJ pushing for citizenship question on census forms: report (12/31/17) [COM_DIS00015707]	*		
PX-584	Email between Peter Davidson and James Uthmeier, subject: Re: Short Fuse: FW: Census / immigration status story (Deadline: Today 2:45 pm) (12/31/17) [COM_DIS00015711]	*		
PX-585	Email between Wendy Teramoto and Wilbur Ross, subject: Re: Calls with DOJ (9/19/17) [COM_DIS00016106]	*		
PX-586	Email between Karen Kelley, Israel Hernandez, Sahra Park-Su, subject: re: Census Matter Follow-Up (9/11/17) [COM_DIS00016564]	*		
PX-587	Email between Alexander Brooke, Israel Hernandez, Wendy Teramoto, subject: re: Follow up on our phone call (7/24/17) [COM_DIS00016571]	*		
PX-588	Email between Kris Kobach, Alexander Brooke, Israel Hernandez, subject: re: Follow up on our phone call (7/24/17) [COM_DIS00016575]	*		

**DEFENDANTS' OBJECTIONS TO PLAINTIFFS' SUPPLEMENTAL  
EXHIBIT LIST**

Exhibit #	Description	Objections	Date Identified (Leave Blank)	Date Entered (Leave Blank)
PX-589	Email between Kris Kobach, Alexander Brooke, Israel Hernandez, subject: re: Follow up on our phone call (7/24/17) [COM_DIS00016577]	*		
PX-590	Email from James Uthmeier and Leonard Shambon, subject: current version (9/15/17) [COM_DIS00017126]	*		
PX-591	Draft Chronological History (8/21/17) [COM_DIS00017127]	*		
PX-592	Email between James Uthmeier and Mark Neuman, subject re: Questions re Census (9/13/17) [COM_DIS00017396]	*		
PX-593	Email between James Uthmeier and Sahra Park-Su, subject: Re: Census Matter Follow-Up (9/11/17) [COM_DIS00017398]	*		
PX-594	Email between James Uthmeier and Peter Davidson, subject: Re: Census Matter Follow-Up (9/9/17) [COM_DIS00017402]	*		
PX-595	Email between Earl Comstock, Peter Davidson, James Uthmeier, Wendy Teramoto, subject: Re: Census Matter Follow-Up (9/7/17) [COM_DIS00017405]	*		
PX-596	Email between Peter Davidson, James Uthmeier, Earl Comstock, Wendy Teramoto, subject: Re: Census Matter Follow-Up (9/7/17) [COM_DIS00017407]	*		
PX-597	Email between Wendy Teramoto , Earl Comstock, Peter Davidson, subject: Re: Census Matter Follow-Up (9/8/17) [COM_DIS00017468]	*		
PX-598	Email to Earl Comstock, subject: Re: Census Matter Follow-Up (9/7/17) [COM_DIS00017499]	*		
PX-599	Email between Wendy Teramoto, Earl Comstock, Peter Davidson, James Uthmeier, subject: Re: Census Matter Follow-Up (9/8/17) [COM_DIS00017554]	*		
PX-600	Email between James Uthmeier and Earl Comstock, subject: Re: Census Matter Follow-Up (9/7/17) [COM_DIS00017585]	*		
PX-601	Email between Macie Leach, Wendy Teramoto and Earl Comstock, subject: FW: SHORT FUSE: Fw: Census / Immigration status story (Deadline: Today 2:45 pm) (12/29/17) [COM_DIS00018193]	*		

**DEFENDANTS' OBJECTIONS TO PLAINTIFFS' SUPPLEMENTAL  
EXHIBIT LIST**

Exhibit #	Description	Objections	Date Identified (Leave Blank)	Date Entered (Leave Blank)
PX-602	Email between Macie Leach, Wendy Teramoto and Earl Comstock, subject: FW: SHORT FUSE: Fw: Census / Immigration status story (Deadline: Today 2:45 pm) (12/29/17) [COM_DIS00018196]	*		
PX-603	Email between Macie Leach, Wendy Teramoto and Earl Comstock, subject: FW: SHORT FUSE: Fw: Census / Immigration status story (Deadline: Today 2:45 pm) (12/29/17) [COM_DIS00018200]	*		
PX-604	Email between Earl Comstock, James Rockas, Sahra Park-Su, subject: Re: 10-12 WAPO - 7am - Republicans could lose congressional seats if Census 2020 goes wrong (10/12/17) [COM_DIS00018535]	401/602/802/901		
PX-605	Email between Earl Comstock and Wendy Teramoto, subject: Fwd: Calls with DOJ (9/19/17) [COM_DIS00018543]	*		
PX-606	Email between Earl Comstock, Peter Davidson, James Uthmeier, Wendy Teramoto, subject: Re: Census Matter Follow-Up (9/8/17) [COM_DIS00018546]	*		
PX-607	Email between Earl Comstock and James Uthmeier, subject: Re: Census paper (8/11/17) [COM_DIS00018588]	*		
PX-608	Email between Earl Comstock and James Uthmeier, subject: Re: Census paper (8/11/17) [COM_DIS00018592]	*		
PX-609	Email between Macie Leach, Wendy Teramoto and Earl Comstock, subject: FW: SHORT FUSE: Fw: Census / Immigration status story (Deadline: Today 2:45 pm) (12/29/17) [COM_DIS00018772]	*		
PX-610	Email between Wendy Teramoto and Peter Davidson, subject: FW: Census Matter Follow-Up (9/7/17) [COM_DIS00018873]	*		
PX-611	Email between Wendy Teramoto and Kris Kobach, subject: Re: Follow up on our phone call (7/24/17) [COM_DIS00018875]	*		
PX-612	Email between Karen Kelley, Israel Hernandez, subject: Re: Census Matter Follow-Up (9/11/17) [COM_DIS00019464]	*		
PX-613	Email between James Uthmeier and [Sahra Park-Su], subject: Re: Census Matter Follow-Up (9/11/17) [COM_DIS00019468]	*		

**DEFENDANTS' OBJECTIONS TO PLAINTIFFS' SUPPLEMENTAL  
EXHIBIT LIST**

Exhibit #	Description	Objections	Date Identified (Leave Blank)	Date Entered (Leave Blank)
PX-614	Email between Karen Kelley, Israel Hernandez, Sahra Park-Su, subject: Re: Census Matter Follow-Up (9/11/17) [COM_DIS00019687]	Clawback requested		
PX-615	Email between James Uthmeier and Sahra Park-Su, subject: Re: Census Matter Follow-Up (9/11/17) [COM_DIS00019691]	*		
PX-616	Email between David Langdon, Burton Reist, Melissa Creech, James Dinwiddie, Lisa Blumerman, subject: Re: Requested Information - Legal Review All Residents... (5/24/17) [COM_DIS00019987]	*		
PX-617	Email between Melissa Creech, Burton Reist, David Langdon, subject: Re: immigrant question - pt 2 (5/24/17) [COM_DIS00020024]	*		
PX-618	Email between Reist Burton, David Langdon, Melissa Creech, subject: Fw: immigrant questions - pt 2 (5/24/17) [COM_DIS00020028]	*		
PX-619	Memo from Robert B. Ellert and Robert Brumley, Counting Illegal Aliens (4/15/88) [COM_DIS00020031]	*		
PX-620	Memo from Robert B. Ellert and Robert Brumley, DOJ/OLP Memorandum on Counting Illegal Aliens in the 1990 Census (4/18/88) [COM_DIS00020058]	*		
PX-621	Letter from Carol T. Crawford, Assistant Attorney General, to Senator Bingaman (9/22/89) [COM_DIS00020062]	*		
PX-622	Email from Earl Comstock, Ellen Herbst, David Langdon, subject: RE: Counting of illegal immigrants (5/24/17) [COM_DIS00020864]	*		
PX-623	Email between Arthur Gary and John Gore, Re: Talking Points (12.18.17) [DOJ00039722]	401/602/802/901		
PX-624	Email between John Gore and Arthur Gary, RE: Talking Points (12.18.17) [DOJ00039725]	401/602/802/901		
PX-625	Email between Arthur Gary and John Gore, Re: Talking Points (12.18.17) [DOJ00039728]	401/602/802/901		
PX-626	Email between John Gore and Arthur Gary , RE: Talking Points (12.18.17) [DOJ00039730]	401/602/802/901		
PX-627	Email between Ben Aguinaga and John Gore, re: Updated Census Letters - FYI (6.14.18) [DOJ00039733]	401/602/802/901		
PX-628	Census Citizenship Question Memo [DOJ00039735]	401/602/802/901		

**DEFENDANTS' OBJECTIONS TO PLAINTIFFS' SUPPLEMENTAL  
EXHIBIT LIST**

Exhibit #	Description	Objections	Date Identified (Leave Blank)	Date Entered (Leave Blank)
PX-629	Email between Devin O'Malley, John Gore, copying Ben Aguinaga, Re: Review: Statement in Response to Citizenship Question on Census (1/2/18) [DOJ00039736]	401/602/802/901		
PX-630	Email between Devin O'Malley, John Gore, copying Ben Aguinaga, Re: Review: Statement in Response to Citizenship Question on Census (1/2/18)[DOJ00039740]	401/602/802/901		
PX-631	Email between Devin O'Malley, John Gore, copying Ben Aguinaga, Re: Review: Statement in Response to Citizenship Question on Census (1/2/18)[DOJ00039743]	401/602/802/901		
PX-632	Email between Devin O'Malley, John Gore, copying Ben Aguinaga and Sarah Isgur Flores, Re: Review: Statement in Response to Citizenship Question on Census (1/2/18)[DOJ00039745]	401/602/802/901		
PX-633	Email between Devin O'Malley, John Gore, copying Ben Aguinaga and Sarah Isgur Flores, Re: Review: Statement in Response to Citizenship Question on Census (1/2/18)[DOJ00039747]	401/602/802/901		
PX-634	Email between Devin O'Malley, John Gore, copying Ben Aguinaga, Re: QFR Responses (6/14/18)[DOJ00039748]	401/602/802/901		
PX-635	Email between Devin O'Malley, John Gore, copying Ben Aguinaga, Re: Review: Statement in Response to Citizenship Question on Census (1/2/18)[DOJ00039749]	401/602/802/901		
PX-636	Email between Devin O'Malley, John Gore, copying Ben Aguinaga, Re: Review: Statement in Response to Citizenship Question on Census (1/2/18)[DOJ00039753]	401/602/802/901		
PX-637	Email between Devin O'Malley, John Gore, copying Ben Aguinaga and Sarah Isgur Flores, Re: Review: Statement in Response to Citizenship Question on Census (1/2/18)[DOJ00039756]	401/602/802/901		
PX-638	Email between Devin O'Malley, John Gore, copying Ben Aguinaga and Sarah Isgur Flores, Re: Review: Statement in Response to Citizenship Question on Census (1/2/18)[DOJ00039758]	401/602/802/901		
PX-639	Email between Rebecca Wertz and Chris Herren, RE: Census Hearing Maloney et. Al (rev3) (5/3/18)[DOJ00039759]	401/602/802/901		

**DEFENDANTS' OBJECTIONS TO PLAINTIFFS' SUPPLEMENTAL  
EXHIBIT LIST**

Exhibit #	Description	Objections	Date Identified (Leave Blank)	Date Entered (Leave Blank)
PX-640	Draft Letter from Stephen Boyd to U.S. Rep. Carolyn Maloney [DOJ00039760]	401/602/802/901		
PX-641	Draft Letter from Stephen Boyd to U.S. Rep. Carolyn Maloney [DOJ00039764]	401/602/802/901		
PX-642	Email between Arthur Gary and John Gore, Re: 2020 census questions (9/11/17)[DOJ00129966]	401/602/802/901		
PX-643	Email between Arthur Gary and Michael Allen, FWD: 2020 census questions (9/11/17)[DOJ00129967]	401/602/802/901		
PX-644	Email between Arthur Gary and Michael Allen, FWD: 2020 census questions (9/12/17)[DOJ00129970]	401/602/802/901		
PX-645	Email between Arthur Gary and John Gore, Re: 2020 census questions (9/11/17)[DOJ00129973]	401/602/802/901		
PX-646	Email between Arthur Gary and John Gore, Re: 2020 census questions (9/11/17)[DOJ00129975]	401/602/802/901		
PX-647	Critical Objective for Census 2020: Reducing & Eliminating Black vs Non-Black Differential Undercount and Why It Matters (7/28/17) [DOJ00129977]	401/602/802/901		
PX-648	Email between Arthur Gary and John Gore, Re: 2020 census questions (9/11/17) [DOJ00129985]	401/602/802/901		
PX-649	Email between Arthur Gary and John Gore, Re: 2020 census questions (9/11/17) [DOJ00129988]	401/602/802/901		
PX-650	Email between A. Gary and J. Gore, Re: 2020 census questions (9/11/17) [DOJ00129990]	401/602/802/901		
PX-651	Draft letter from DOJ to John Thompson, Dir. Bureau of Census [DOJ00129991]	401/602/802/901		
PX-652	Schedule for Sec. Ross, 2018, Updated Redacted	401/602/901		
PX-653	Schedule for Secretary Ross's Conference Room, 2018, Updated Redacted	401/602/901		
PX-654	Schedule for Secretary Ross's Conference Room, 2017, FOIA Redacted	401/602/901		
PX-655	U.S. Census Bureau (June 8, 2018), Proposed Information Collection, 2020 Census. Federal Register Notice. Vol. 83 (111), p. 26649.	401		
PX-656	Memorandum from Center for Survey Measurement to ADRM re: Respondent Confidentiality Concerns, unredacted	602/901		